



Intertextuality in the Pro-Left and Pro-Islamist Magazines in Pakistan: A Critical Discourse Analysis

Ghulam Ghous¹
Dr. Umar ud Din²

ABSTRACT:

This article is an investigation into the discursive practice of intertextuality in the texts of pro-left magazine Al-Fatah and pro-Islamist magazine Chattan during the Cold War. It applies the second aspect of Fairclough's triangular model of socio-discourse analysis (SDA), i.e., discourse as discursive practice, and the notion of ideological square from socio-cognitive analysis (SCA) of Van Dijk to explore the discursive practices found in the data obtained from chosen magazines. It focuses on the linguistic category of intertextuality to examine the production and consumption of discourse (text). It also delves into the hidden agendas found in the reporting of chosen periodicals. On the point of producing text, the journalists consider various elements, e.g., editorial policy and choices of the news organization, the targeted addressees, and finally, but importantly, the ideological leanings of the news organization. These magazines quoted different sources including political leaders, journalists, religious scholars, and others to challenge their rival ideas in discourse. They quoted from both the we-group and them-group. They used we-group voices to show it positively as well as them-group negatively; on the contrary, they used them-group voices to portray them negatively.

Key Words: Intertextuality, discourse as discursive practice, critical discourse analysis, ideological conflict, Al-Fatah, Chattaan

¹ University of Okara (ghulamghous@uo.edu.pk)

² The University of Faisalabad





Introduction

The Cold War precisely began with the dropping of atomic bombs over the ill-fated cities of Hiroshima and Nagasaki in 1945, which effectively ended WWII. The Cold War then continued for the next five and a half decades between the ideologies of communism and capitalism and their ideological allies. Throughout this time, several nations were engaged in the conflict as part of either a capitalistic block headed by the USA or a communist block headed by the USSR. This conflict appeared mainly due to the incompatible ideologies that played a role in making it ideology-based (Kramer, 1999). For a long time, it continuously kept the superpowers engaged in indirect confrontations through a war of ideas. In Pakistan, the Cold War also had various dimensions and was linked to the global debates around which it was fought. In many ways, the debates and practices of the Cold War in Pakistan could be seen as a continuation of the ideological tussle between the rival camps of communism/socialism and capitalism. Owing to its inclusion in SEATO and CENTO, Pakistan's security was heavily dependent on the United States. Other than security, the Cold War also had impacts on the economy, society, politics, and ideological underpinnings of the country. The Cold War polarized Pakistani society politically and ideologically in all domains of life, particularly the media. The polemics between intellectuals, ideologues, scholars, academics, journalists, political leaders, and all sorts of public thinkers from both camps were a significant feature of Cold War debates in Pakistan. They countered the ideas of each other on all the public and institutional forums. They wrote books, published pamphlets, and particularly wrote columns and articles in newspapers and magazines to disseminate their views in public and win over the masses.

During the Cold War, various magazines in Pakistan were affiliated with the ideologies of the left and right. Not only did these magazines have their ideologies, but their agendas were also revealed in their reporting and content. They were divided on the basis of the ideologies of socialism/communism and Islam/democracy. Pro-Islamist magazines highlighted their favoured ideals of the Islamic way of life and culture while denouncing the problems and defects of communism and socialism. The pro-left magazines glorified the ideologies of socialism and communism and admired their accomplishments and advantages. They also targeted the values of U.S.-led Western capitalistic democracy. This article focuses on the role and strategies of the selected political periodicals in ideological conflict.

An important facet of Cold War politics is the discourses, counter-discourses, and practices that accompany these discourses to win over the masses and assert the primacy of the ideals they adhered to. Both Islamists and leftists made attempts in this regard; however, their attempts were countered by ideologues from both camps who not only provided a critique of the rival narrative but also confronted it in all domains of life. An analysis of the discursive practices of selected magazines is equally important as discourses and counter-discourses because it helps better understand the nature and complexity of issues related to the Cold War in Pakistan. Such an





analysis is also vital for understanding how different discourses produce certain meanings and helps better comprehend the Cold War ideological conflict in discourse.

Theoretical Framework

This paper is an investigation into the discursive practice of intertextuality of the pro-left magazine Al-Fatah and pro-Islamist magazine Chattaan. It adopts CDA as its analytical framework drawing on the models of Norman Fairclough (2012) and Van Dijk (1998) to delve into the discursive world of selected periodicals. Given the research emphasis on the utilization of language by ideologically motivated political periodicals to inculcate certain ideas, convince, as well as influence the public, and bolster and refute particular theses, CDA seems the most suitable methodology. Moreover, CDA appears to be the most relevant methodology for a study whose aim is to get insight into an ideological conflict full of discourses and counter-discourses, because it can help delve into the key areas of ideology and conflict.

This study is unique owing to its use of the magazine data for analysis. It manifests a contribution to the media discourse analysis. It selects two ideologically driven political magazines i.e. Al-Fatah and Chattaan for the analysis of intertextuality. The rationale behind the selection of these two magazines mainly is their representation of two contrasting ideologies. Al-Fatah was a pro-left magazine in its orientation which represented the leftist and social forces in Pakistan. In contrast, Chattaan was an anti-communist magazine which was a mouthpiece of the pro-Islamist forces. Through CDA of magazine discourse, this article investigates the question: at the discursive practice level, which intertextuality, as well as strategies, was employed in the arrangement of Cold War ideological conflict in Pakistani media discourse?

Critical Discourse Analysis

CDA has been chosen by numerous researchers who have reached an understanding of certain principles of analysis. Norman Fairclough, Van Dijk, Ruth Wodak, Leeuwen and James Paul Jee stand out among them. CDA surfaced by the end of the eighties, and within a short time, it developed into a paramount branch of discourse analysis (Blommaert & Bulcean, 2000). Although the CDA has its genesis in the times of classical rhetoric which is linked with names such as Aristotle who drew various structures of discourse, however, the fundamentals of CDA are founded on the work of Fowler, Hodge, Kress and Trew on critical aspects of language, power and ideology as well as on Michael Halliday's systematic functional linguistics (Blommaert, 2005). Fairclough is regarded as the founder of CDA who matured it in the eighties by suggesting a triangulated model for the analysis of discourse. His SDA links text to discursive and social practices of the discourse. It is based on the efforts of Trew, Saussure, Halliday, Foucault and Bakhtin as they have played an important part in the development of critical linguistics among the primary schools of discourse in the seventies.

Discourse is the principal term in CDA which however has different meanings in different disciplines. Additionally, it indicates that distinct meanings exist in various linguistic contexts. In European and German contexts, the terms 'text' and 'discourse' are regarded as dissimilar things as 'text' refers to written language whereas 'discourse' pertains to spoken form while 'discourse' is used in both written and verbal contexts in English speaking world (Weiss & Wodak, 2003). Discourse analysis regards discourse as a semantic entity which entails linguistic practices and is



keen to analyze the discourse linguistically (Spitzmuller & Warnke, 2011). Bloomaert (2005) understands it as “comprising all forms of meaningful semiotic human activity seen in connection with social, cultural and historical patterns and developments of use” (p. 3). What differentiates CDA from discourse analysis is its critical nature which is associated with all CDA approaches. CDA looks at ideology, power, hegemony, voice and dominance.

Discourse as Discursive Practice

Discursive practices can be stated as acts in the discourse but it is hard to understand them in isolation. At the discursive level, discourse is grasped as an object that is generated, disseminated, dispersed and consumed in society. The utterances, consistency, and intertextuality are all taken into consideration since they link the text with its context (Blommaert & Bulcaen, 2000). Fairclough has admitted the notion of intertextuality into CDA. Fairclough (1995) classifies intertextuality into two types: open intertextuality and constitutive Intertextuality. Open intertextuality implicates how texts openly rely upon other writings (for example the usage of quote marks that symbolize other writings) and constitutive intertextuality or interdiscursivity that is texts are comprised of different components (generic norms, discourse characteristics, register and style). The concept of intertextuality refers to the fact that texts from the past and the present are tied to one another. This connection can be made “through continued reference to a topic or main actors; through reference; or by the transfer of main arguments from one text into the next” (Wodak, 2008, p. 3).

The purpose of analysis at the discursive practice level is to disclose the information that pertains to recognizing the fabricated societal facts, social relations, knowledge, and concepts as well as to reveal the link between text and its makers (Fairclough, 1989). The target of analysis here is to understand the various discourse elements. The idea is to establish connections between the analysis of the discursive and the textual level. Besides the items stated above, the analysis of discursive practices of discourse encompasses the analysis of the environment or stage at which these texts are produced. In addition, it pays attention to the intent behind using such platforms to write texts as well as what they consider to establish.

Ideological Square

One leading aspect of three dimensional model of SCA of Dijk is the notion of ideological square which explains how different societal groups characterize themselves in good terms and portray other groups in bad terms. The fabrications of ideologies are connoted in a ‘we vs. them dichotomy’ in which adherents of a particular societal group describe themselves as important and trustworthy and supporters of rival groups are disgraced (Ramanathan & Hoon, 2015). There exists a division in which media groups assert their good deeds themselves and conceal their bad actions whilst mitigating the good deeds of rival groups and headlining their bad actions. The notion of ideological square consists of quadruple steps: (1) accentuate our good properties; (2) accentuate their bad properties; (3) minimize their good actions; and (4) minimize our bad actions. Any characteristic of discourse that “expresses, establishes, confirms or emphasizes a self-interested group opinion, perspective or position, especially in a broader socio-political context of social struggle, is a candidate for special attention in ideological analysis” (Dijk, 1998, p. 23).



Psychological depiction of doings becomes significant to SCA especially when there are conflicting interests.

This article makes use of the ideological square to investigate how nominated ideologically driven political magazines portrayed positive self-semblance and negative semblance of others in the middle of a war of ideologies. This notion also assists in demonstrating in what manner these magazines lionized the characteristics of the we-group and disgraced the them-group.

Intertextuality in the Chosen Periodicals

Intertextuality is attributed to the reference and narration of an already-existing text. Whilst talking and scripting, we put in a specific context and recontextualize the talks and conversations of others. While describing intertextuality Bakhtin (1986) put that:

The text lives only by coming into contact with another text (with context). Only at this point of contact between texts does a light flash, illuminating both the posterior and anterior, joining a given text to a dialogue. We emphasize that this contact is dialogic contact between text ... Behind this contact is a contact of personalities and not of things. (p. 1)

This definition of intertextuality shows how a text in progress is connected with the already established ones and is regarded as "ubiquitous and foundational, comprehending all of the ways that utterances can resonate with other utterances and constitutive of consciousness, society and culture" (Bauman, 2004, p. 5). Instead of living in seclusion texts are alluded to other texts in earlier and current times. Intertextuality views writings in various hypothetical and allusive relations with other texts. This provides us with a hint of how nominated periodicals utilized different voices from society and entrenched/embedded texts to bolster their views and fight the opposing ideals and antagonistic actors in discourse. The nominated magazines borrowed and cited from or alluded to the principal provider to restate the challenge of the conflicting ideals and established traditions. Moreover, these magazines quoted and made allusions to such parts of renowned sources and the public that tend to disparage, condemn and challenge the thoughts of opposing powers and their beliefs.

The exploration of the nominated periodicals' intertextuality depends on four points: (1) the quoting patterns in nominated periodicals' intertextuality; (2) the sort of sources these periodicals cited; (3) the part of their speech cited, as well as (4) what the nominated weeklies wanted to achieve by connecting their substance (text) with others' speeches.

The analysis divulges how nominated periodicals manipulated three categories of citation patterns i.e. direct, indirect and strategic to strengthen their claims of we-group and them-group, their readers and other noteworthy societal segments. Citations from common citizens, political personalities, ulemas, zealots, journalists, scholars, weeklies and dailies make up the intertextuality of nominated periodicals. The choice of quotation patterns, sources quoted and the verbs are ideological tools that embody ideologies which in turn polarize the readers into we-group and them-group.

Intertextuality in Al-Fatah

This segment explores how Al-Fatah cited sources that they regarded valuable. It predominantly concentrated on the voices that were more valuable and those which were of little



or no importance. The evidence shows how Al-Fatah utilized direct, indirect and strategic quotations to point out their claims from we-group and them-group.

Direct Quotations from We-group

Al-Fatah made use of plenty of direct quotations. These citations approve and endorse the thoughts published in Al-Fatah. Al-Fatah mainly relies on the voices of the we-group. Naturally, verbs used while citing these quotations are neutral. The evidence indicates voices of the public and the readers of Al-Fatah were used by the magazine to demonstrate them-group magazine shadily. The statements of a vendor and a newspaper boy have been cited by Al-Fatah in the first two examples. They both are downgrading the them-group daily Jasarat because it has very little circulation and is disliked by the public. Example 1 mentions the Makrani pronunciation, idiom and vocabulary and example 2 refers to the daily Jasarat as reliant on financial support provided by the followers of the Jamaat-e-Islami. In example 3, the Al-Fatah cited a magazine reader who mocked the them-group periodical Chattaan by ridiculing its front page. The literary devices of ridicule and satire are employed in these citations.

1. Translation from Urdu text: A Makrani newspaper boy comments in his specific style, "Hey no one demands this Jasarat, even no one is ready to have it for free. If you throw a copy of Jasarat on your own the customer rushes to thrash you" (Shaam, 1970, p. 8).

2. The newsweekly Chattaan vendor Habib who sells newspapers before a cafeteria has an interesting notice pasted, "Do not be ashamed by demanding the newspaper that is run on donation" (Shaam, 1970, p. 8).

3. Newsweekly Chattaan has published a stanza on the coloured margins of the title: "Though the Jamaat has idols in their sleeves. But I have been ordained to say aloud "La ilaha ill Allah" (there is no God but Allah). The question arises whether the word Jamaat (party) refers to Jamaat-e-Islami" (Sohail, 1970, p. 38).

Al-Fatah also utilized direct quotations from various we-group sources containing distinguished persons to denigrate the them-group. Example 4 is a reference to the anthem of China "East is red" and the message given through the words of the song. Example 5 has provided a sentence "Islam is a progressive religion" and it brings to our minds the famous Progressive Movement of the sub-continent. The aforementioned remark alludes that Islam and the Progressive Movement are very similar to each other. Here we find intertextuality adding a new dimension to the comment given in the example. Moreover, intertextuality further elaborates the example and this new elucidation has empowered the Al-Fatah to use information to support its we-group and to condemn the them-group. Example 6 refers to a saying of the Holy Prophet (SAW) and early Islamic jurisprudence. The presence of these allusions indicates the existence of intertextuality in the example.

4. When China, on April 24, 1970, launched into space its first satellite, they broadcast the famous anthem "The East Is Red" through this Chinese satellite. The anthem says, "The east is red. The sun rises in the east. Mao Tse Tung also belongs to the east. He has devoted himself to the service of people. He is the great Messiah of people. Chairman Mao loves people dearly. Chinese Communist Party has won freedom for people" (1970, p. 13).



5. Air Marshal Noor Khan appreciates Islam for its progressive nature. He comments "There is no room for papacy in Islam. Religion is a matter between God and me. I do not need any religious scholar or Maulana Maududi to get me connected with God and explain the principles of Islam. I should myself understand the teachings of Islam for me" (Shaam, 1970, p. 6).

6. "In this way, he by distorting the religion presented such a dangerous philosophy which will turn the religion into a slave of baser passions if it prevails in the society. Maulana Maududi adopted the new standpoint to defend his earlier view and said that prohibitions are of two kinds; everlasting and temporary and he termed the issue relating to women's participation in the election as temporary prohibition" (Shaam & Rao, 1970, p. 6).

Direct Quotations from Them-group

Al-Fatah also alluded to direct quotations from the them-group to show its negativity. Al-Fatah utilized verbs with positive and neutral connotations while citing these them-group sources. Al-Fatah cited Maulana Maududi (them-group) to disparage him in front of the public. However, ironically it employed verbs with positive and neutral connotations while reporting Maududi's statement as illustrated in examples 7 and 8. Example 7 compares the concept of sovereignty in Islam with the Western idea of sovereignty. In example 8, the journalist has highlighted authoritarian tendencies in Jamaat-e-Islami and its Amir by referring to Nazism and Fascism. The writer opines if unluckily Jamaat comes to rule the country it will behave like Mussolini's National Fascist Party and Hitler's Nazi Party.

7. Maulana Maududi had declared it blatantly, "As a Muslim I have no interest in the issue that the Muslims should rule the place where they are in majority. To me, the most important question is whether this Pakistani system of government will be based on the sovereignty of God or the sovereignty of people following the Western concept of government. In the first case it will be "Pakistan" (the land of the pure) otherwise it will be "Na-Pakistan" (the land of unholy people) like that part of the country where the non-Muslims will rule by the scheme, rather it will be even more unholy in the eyes of God" (Shahid, 1970, p. 25).

8. Mr. Maududi declared outrightly, "You have the examples of Germany and Italy before your eyes today. The unprecedented power that Hitler and Mussolini got is praised by the whole world but do you know what the reasons are for their success? They are faith and obedience to their leader. Nazi and Fascist parties could never have been so powerful if they had not a firm belief in their principles and if they were not strictly obedient to their leaders" (Shaam, 1970, p. 6).

Indirect Quotations from We-group

Indirect citations also have been quoted by the magazine Al-Fatah from we-group to reinforce its viewpoint. It uses verbs with neutral connotations while citing these opinions. But while going through indirect citations the reader cannot easily distinguish between the words used by the journalist and those of the source. Fairclough (1995) aptly recognizes that one of the remarkable features of indirect citation is that "although it is expected to be accurate about the propositional content of what was said, it is ambivalent about the actual words that were used. It may simply reproduce them, or it may transform and translate them into discourses which fit more easily with the reporter's voice" (p. 81). Example 9 refers to a brother organisation of Jamaat-e-Islami i.e. Al-Badar. "Al-Badar" reminds us of its part in the 1971 war. It daunted the people of



Bengal and Al-Fatah is criticizing this standpoint. Example 10 mentions "English" as a clear indication of intertextuality because it brings to our mind the reign of the British. It compares the foreign rulers and the native rulers of Indo-Pak. In example 11, the phrase "four marriages" refers to the Islamic culture in which polygamy is practised and "very magnificent beard" highlights the physical look Muslim theologians adopt. Example 12 quotes a stanza referring to Pharaoh's slayings of the children of Bani Israel. At the same time, it points out the aid given by the Americans to other nations to enslave them. The act of slaying the children on the part of Pharaoh is very much comparable with the impacts of the US aid. Both aim at annihilating the other nations.

9. Mr Rashid Butt referring to the jubilation on the part of Jamaat-e-Islami and Islami Jamiat Talba on the 25th of March comments, they consider themselves the sole claimant of faithfulness to Pakistan. The people of East Pakistan now need a certificate from Al-Badar to the effect that they are faithful to Pakistan (Siddiqi, 1971, p. 13).

10. Dr. Lohia calls Nehru a political Nehru. He says that Nehru's mind is English. He is an Englishman though in black color and the government of Nehru consists of black Englishmen. White Englishmen have been replaced by black Englishmen (Hamesh, 1970, p. 23).

11. Big and fat Sarkar Gul works in a government office as a peon. He is unmarried. Moreover, his parents are also dead. I inquired of him why he did not marry. When he heard my question he started laughing and said, sir, it is very difficult for me to meet my expenses. How could I bear the expenses of my wife and children? Then in a very intimate manner, he whispered to me, only those who have four wives can enjoy life. Then he pretended to have a grand beard and started passing his hand on it (1970, p. 42).

12. Akbar Alahabadi once satirically remarked Pharaoh killed the children of Israelites and was condemned for his brutal act but if he had opened a college for these children he could have achieved his end without being a target of condemnation. Akbar composed this verse a long time after the Pharaoh had passed away. If Akbar Alahabadi had spoken these words during the rule of Pharaoh he must not have opened college for the children of Israelites. Thus he had achieved his purpose without killing the children. However, America was prudent enough to have paid attention to Akbar Alahabadi's advice and it opened a college called the College of American Aid. This college had helped America enslave African, Asian and Latin American nations without becoming a target of condemnation. Rather he had won the fame of being a helper of newly freed nations (Ansari, 1970, p. 15).

Indirect Quotations from Them-group

Al-Fatah also utilized the quoting pattern of indirect quotations from the we-group. Neutral verbs were utilized to cite the quoted voices. Example 13 refers to the verse of famous Marxist poet Josh Maleeh Abaadi and expressions of Nazo and behavior are being explained in consideration of the poetry of Josh. Nazo's shyness and Josh's act of kissing and touching have been condemned by highlighting his verses cited in the excerpt. The term "Kharjites" in the next example i.e. example 14 refers to a band of rioters that appeared in the early part of Islamic history. These Kharjites launched a violent Khaarji movement during the caliphate of Hazrat Ali. The people of this group were obsessed with certain views and sought to enforce them on Muslim



masses. The cluster of hundred and thirteen Islamic religious scholars who delivered a decree against socialism is being linked to the Kharjites people.

13. As bad luck would have it, a very beautiful girl had to become a prostitute. She was called Nazo. She was beautiful and witty. The pimp informed Josh Malihabadi that there had come a new item girl in the market. Josh replied positively, "You should bring it". The day and date were fixed and we arrived at the prostitute's house. Music flowed and Nazo started dancing reciting a verse: 'Honour for men is limitless. The enemy curses but we blush'.

When Nazo uttered the word blush she pretended to blush in a way that seemed very much natural. She seemed to have never known any boldness. Josh took the girl in his arms and began kissing her. It annoyed me greatly and I had to warn Josh (behave yourself). You must have opted for a human attitude (Darwesh, 1970, p. 27).

14. Maulana Maududi declared that he was struggling to establish the rule of God. This phrase was coined by Kharjites who declared that only God had the authority to reign. They were the first among the Muslims to declare some people Kafirs by issuing a collective Fatwa. These days some 113 religious scholars, following the practice of Kharjites declared socialism as Kufar but they must keep in mind that the slogan of rule of God targeted Hazrat Ali's rule but the Muslim Ummah have never accepted this slogan (Shaam & Rao, 1970, p. 7).

Scare Quotes

The data shows the magazine Al-Fatah employing scare quotes to highlight the challenges posed by individuals from a variety of segments of society to them-group. Ginnekin (2002) states that utilizing quotation marks around some statement targets indirectly challenging the content of the quoted opinion while disengaging the editor or the reporter from the consequences and factuality of the words thus quoted. The reporter of the indirect dialogue uses scare quotation marks to fend him/herself off from such contentious statements e.g. someone claims that 'a woman's place is in the house'. The use of scare quotes can be likened to the employment of phrases like "so-called" "so described", "what he regarded" and like others which is obvious in example 15. Again the verbs used for reporting have neutral connotations. Example 15 displays that the discourse Al-Badar adopted is antithetical to the discourse employed by the leftists where in the scare quotes have been used the words like "Al-Badar" (a group belonging to JI), "traitors", "terrorists", "treason". The terms "imperialism" as well as "colonialism" in example 16 bring to our mind the times when Western colonial powers plundered different regions in the world. The use of "Ichhra" in example 17 resembles Ka'ba Sharif and this word gives us a contrast of Ka'ba with Ichhra and in this manner, Jamaat-e-Islami is being critiqued.

15. Mr Rashid Butt accused Al-Badar of killing people who had different political views and were very forward-looking in East Pakistan. They declared their opponents "traitors" as well as "terrorists". This standpoint has forced the majority of the students to abandon politics. They do not involve themselves in politics for fear they might be termed "traitors" (Siddiqi, 1971, p. 13).

16. Colonies were considered trade centres to earn wealth by the imperialistic powers. Lord Macaulay said, "The rivers of wealth were flowing from India towards England" (Zuberi, 1971, p. 61).





17. Sheikh Rasheed is the “sinful” leader who devastatingly defeated Maulvi Tufail Muhammad who belongs to “Ichhra” which has always been admired by “these two brothers”. But since he was defeated he has disappeared from the scene (Al-Fateh, 1970).

Intertextuality in the Text of Chattaan

The following part demonstrates how Chattaan used the patterns of direct, indirect and scare quotations to represent claims from the we-group and them-group. Chattaan quoted statements from Islamic scholars, intellectuals, politicians, journalists, newspapers, and readers. Chattaan cited the opinions of the we-group as well as them-group to restate the challenge they posed.

Direct Quotes from We-group

Chattaan quoted direct opinions of powerful individuals belonging to the we-group. The use by Chattaan, of the prominent persons’ statements to reinforce these accounts reflects the Bauman’s consequential correlation of meditation routines (2004). In example 18, Iqbal presents the perspective of spirituality. The use of the word “opium” here generates intertextuality as it refers to the discourse adopted by Karl Marx. Marx has offered his materialistic understanding of the world and the word "opium" makes a comparison of Marx's dogma with the ideology of Iqbal. In example 19, the phrases "flagbearers of the modern approach to Islam", "the religion of Ghulam Ahmad Parvez and Fazlur Rehman", and "conservative approach to the interpretation of Islam" familiarize us with three viewpoints adopted to understand Islam. The expression "ideological boundaries" brings to us the philosophies of the ideology of Islam and the ideology of Pakistan in example 20. Chattaan also utilized the direct quotation pattern to incorporate the masses' voices to denigrate rival groups. These voices represented the opinions of the people in general, and at the same time they reflected the opinions of the readers of the magazine as expressed in their 'letters to the editor'. The expression "ideological foundation" refers to Pakistani Muslims' ideology in example 21.

18. Iqbal says "Advocates of socialism everywhere are against spirituality and religion. They consider it opium. The word opium was first of all used for this purpose by Karl Marx. I am a Muslim and I will die a Muslim. I believe that the material interpretation of the history of man is false altogether. I believe in spirituality but only in the sense Quran uses it" (Nizami, 1970, p. 8).

19. Shorish Kashmiri criticized the people who considered themselves to be champions of Islam and brought disgrace to it. He wrote, "Excuse me! When Pakistan was coming into existence it was not the Islam of Parvez or Fazlur Rehman that rekindled the passion of people. It is the pure life of these Mullahs which had shaken the wine houses and edifice of idols. At the time of Quaid-e-Azam and Quaid-e-Millat, Maulana Shabbir Ahmad Usmani and Maulana Syed Suleman Nadvi represented Islam and not Fazlur Rehman and Ghulam Ahmad Parvez" (Chaudry, 1969, p. 19).

20. In his inaugural address in Lahore, Former Air Chief Marshal Asghar Khan asserted, "Today not only are Pakistani territorial frontiers in peril but our ideological frontiers are also in danger. It is therefore necessary that we should stand up for the protection of our ideological boundaries and waking up from our dormant state we should work for those aims and objectives for which we got a separate homeland" (Bashir, 1969, p. 16).



21. "You have strengthened the ideological foundation of Pakistan by fighting socialism and communism" (Yousuf, 1963).

Direct Quotes from Them-group

To malign the them-group Chattaan reported their direct quotations. The verbs with neutral connotations were utilized to cite voices from the them-group. Example 22 mentions "capitalism", "socialism" and "communism" to refer to three dissimilar governmental systems. At the same time, it refers to the battle and conflict going on between them. Example 23 specifies through the term "communist ethics" a system of ethics that belongs to the communists and is often at war with the ethical values practised by the people universally. Example 24 indicates the particular discourse adopted by the followers of Marx believing in materialism through the use of the terms "Marxism", "materialism", and the expression "enmity towards religion".

22. Lenin said, "For the socialist system to replace the capitalistic system of government is impossible without a revolution involving violence" (Gereeb-e-Shehar, 1969, p. 8).

23. Lenin says, "According to communist ethics it is the most important duty and that it should be recognized as such that dishonesty and swindling can be used when there is a need. That was the greatest sacrifice which revolution demanded from us" (Gereeb-e-Shehar, 1969, p. 8).

24. Lenin says, "Marxism is another name of materialism. It is the most bitter enemy of realism" (Gilani, 1969, p. 15).

Indirect Quotations from We-group

No use of indirect quotations was found from the we-group in the data of Chattaan.

Indirect Quotations from Them-group

Chattaan utilized indirect citations from them-group in its reporting to malign it. Chattaan employed negative as well as neutral verbs to report these voices. Example 25 alludes to the famous saying of Marx "the religion is opium of the poor". It serves as a reminder of the Marxian ideological epitome. In example 26, the expression "Halwa" alludes to a specific indigenous discourse (regarding Mullah) prevalent in the society of Pakistan.

25. Marx considers religion the opium of the poor. Without wiping it out you cannot establish a socialist society (Gilani, 1969, p. 15).

26. In Imroz often such Punjabi articles get published that make fun of religion, life after death, paradise and hell etc. A socialist poet denigrated paradise and said that when he looked into the paradise he saw a Mullah who was dozing beside a big plate of Halwa (Gilani, 1969, p. 16).

Strategic Quotations

Chattaan also utilized scare quotes to pose challenges to their opponents from we-group and them-group voices which they contemplated relevant. Chattaan adopted scare quotes to keep itself seemingly detached from the hostility inherent in the expressions, idioms and clauses. It uses verbs with neutral connotations to report these voices. For example, 27 scare quotes have been used to criticize President Khrushchev. The name "Sputnik" is reminiscent of the race between the Soviet Union and the United States going on in space during the days of the Cold War. The editor of the magazine disapproves President's account that he searched for God all around in space. Example 28 refers to the poetry of Iqbal. The metaphor "Moses without light" reminds us of the Prophet Moses and the expression "the Christ without Cross" of Prophet Jesus Christ. God threw



his Tajalli to the Mountain of Sinai where Prophet Moses had gone to converse with the Almighty. These expressions indirectly emphasized the presence of God quite contrary to Marx who did not believe in such presence. He did not possess the knowledge which Moses had. The expression "the prophet who does not know the truth" reinforces the point of view expressed in his line that Karl Marx was a prophet without having a book. In example 28 the editor again poses to dissociate himself from the expression used while Iqbal is quoted to denigrate Marx. The phrase "atheist materialism" in fact directs our attention to the world of Islamic ideology. This is an instance of the use of a strategic quotes pattern where the editor places the expression "atheist materialism" in quotation marks to demonstrate that the disapproval of communism does not belong to the editor but to Iqbal whose voice is quoted in the excerpt. Generally, strategic quotes are utilized by an editor to keep himself aloof from the material quoted; however, example 29 offers a different use of scare quotes. Also using strategic quotes the editor approves the Iqbal's portrayal of Marxism as "atheist materialism".

27. When the Soviet Union sent Sputnik to space Mr. Khrushchev said that they searched "the whole space" to find out God but they failed (Gilani, 1969, p. 13).

28. When Allama Iqbal regards Marx, theorizer of communism derogatively as "the prophet who does not know the truth", "Moses without light" and "the Christ without a cross" how it is possible that would appreciate his ideas (Nizami, 1970, p. 8).

29. Iqbal has declared that socialism is not acceptable in any way because it is just an "atheistic materialism" (Nizami, 1970, p. 8).

Conclusion

This article probed into the discursive practice of intertextuality in the reporting of the selected magazines i.e. Al-Fatah and Chattaan. It employed a combination of two CDA methodologies: Fairclough's CDA and ideological square from Van Dijk's SCA to reveal the kind of intertextuality used by the selected magazines. These magazines quoted different sources including political leaders, ideologues, journalists, religious scholars, prominent figures from different fields of life and last but not least ordinary citizens to challenge their rival ideas in discourse. They quoted from both the we-group and them-group. Based on intertextuality the notion of ideological square seems quite relevant if we view it in the light of Van Dijk's notion of positive self-projection and negative projection of others. They used we-group voices to show it positively as well as them-group negatively; on the contrary, they used them-group voices to portray them negatively.

Both pro-left and pro-Islamist magazines employed direct, indirect and strategic quotes to represent ideological conflict and report the expressions of the people they considered newsworthy. No wonder these magazines used the voices that proved helpful for them to eulogize their favourite ideologies and belittle and ridicule the opposing ideologies in the discourse. These magazines used positive, negative and positive verbs while reporting these voices. The positive verbs were employed to quote we-group while negative and neutral verbs were used to quote them-group voices. In such a manner, all the voices that were quoted played their role in the discourse, conferring a great favour upon these magazines. These voices supported their claims about the we-



group and them-group. In sum, the selected magazines used quotation patterns and verbs as ideological tools to influence the opinions of the masses.

References

- (1970, 12 31). *Al-Fateh*.
- Mao ka chand. (1970, 06 04). *Al-Fateh*, p. 13.
- Mehnat kashon kay interview. (1970, 7 6). *Al-Fateh*, p. 42.
- Ansari, S. (1970, 8 13). Amreeki imdad ka pas-e-manzar. *Al-Fateh*, pp. 15-16.
- Azim, M. U., Hussain, Z., Bhatti, A. M., Iqbal, M., & Chohan, M. (2017). Caught between the extremes: A comparative study of state owned news channel and a private news channel. *Hamdard Islamicus*, 40(2), 301-314.
- Azim, M. U., Hussain, Z., Munir, A., & Iqbal, M. (2021). McDonaldization of Education in Pakistan: A Step Towards Dehumanization. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 15(2), 858-869.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail. (1986). *Rabelais and his world*. Blomington: Indiana University Press.
- Bashir, M. (1969, 03 03). Awami tehreek ki Asia bhar mein nirali misaal. *Chattan*, pp. 15-16.
- Bauman, R. (2004). *A world of other's words: Cross-cultural perspectives on intertextuality*. Malden: Blackwell Publishing.
- Bhatti, A. M., Azhar, M. A., & Jalil, M. K. (2020). Hybridity in TV Commercials constructing the modernity: A critical discourse analysis approach. *Competitive Social Sciences Research Journal (CSSRJ)*, 1(1), 39-59. <http://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3986678>
- Blommaert, J. (2005). *Discourse: a critical introduction*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Chaudry, M. (1969, 03 03). Door se Shorish khudayan e majazi ko salam. *Chattan*, pp. 17-19.
- Darwesh. (1970, 07 09). Issay kya kahye. *Al-Fateh*, pp. 26-30.
- Dijk, V. (1985). Discourse analysis in (mass) communication research. In V. Dijk, *Discourse and communication: New approaches to the analysis of mass media and communication* (pp. 69-93). Berlin: De Gruyter.
- Dijk, V. (1998). Opinions and ideologies in the press. In A. B. Garrett, *Approaches to media discourse* (pp. 21-63). Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Limited.
- Dijk, T. A. (2005). Politics, ideology and discourse. In K. Brown, *Elsevier Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics* (pp. 728-740). The University of Michigan.
- Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and power*. New York: Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (1995). *Media discourse*. London: Hodder Arnold.
- Fairclough, N. (2012). Critical discourse analysis. In Fairclough & M. James Paul Gee, *The Routledge handbook of discourse analysis* (pp. 9-20). New York: Routledge.
- Gereeb-e-Shehar. (1969, March 03). Socialism kya hai? Basilsila-e-sarmayadari aur socialism. *Chattan*, pp. 08-09.
- Gilani, A. (1969, 03 17). Fareb khurdahen kay naam. *Chattan*, pp. 12-16.





- Gilbert Weiss, & Ruth Wodak. (2003). *Introduction: Theory, interdisciplinarity and critical discourse analysis*. In Gilbert Weiss & Ruth Wodak, *critical discourse analysis: theory and interdisciplinarity* (pp. 1-34). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ginnekin, V. (2002). *Global news: A critical introduction*. London: Sage.
- Hamesh, A. (1970, 06 18). Bharat aik safar. *Al-Fateh*, pp. 24-26.
- Hussain, Z., Azim, M, U., Bhatti, A, M, & Gulfam, G, K. (2021). The Sociolinguistic Impact of Sexist Hate Speech in Gender Discriminatory Pictorial Memes on Facebook. *Competitive Social Science Research Journal (CSSRJ)*, 2(4), 212-222.
- Jaan Blommaert & Chris Bulcean. (2000). Critical discourse analysis. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 29(1), 447-466.
- Kramer, M. (1999). Ideology and the Cold War. *Review of the International Studies*, 25, 539-576.
- Nizami, M. (1970, 03 31). Iqbal aur Quaid-e-Azam socialist thay? *Chattan*, p. 08.
- Ramanathan, R., & Hoon, T. B. (2015). application of critical discourse analysis in media discourse studies. *3L: Southeast Asian Journal of English Language Studies*, 21(3).
- Shaam, M. (1970, 06 04). Air Marshal Noor Khan kay eham siyasi faislay. *Al-Fateh*, p. 06.
- Shaam, M. (1970, 06 18). Zahri khabren androoni kahaniyan. *Al-Fateh*, pp. 05-08.
- Shaam, M. (1970, 06 25). Zahri khabren, androoni kahaniyan: General Amrao Khan ki pur-israr sargarmiyan. *Al-Fateh*, pp. 05-06.
- Shahid. (1970, 07 09). Du badu. *Al-Fateh*, pp. 22-25.
- Sohail, T. (1970, 07 02). Qara'een kehtay hain. *Al-Fateh*, p. 38.
- Spitzmuller, Jurgen, & Warnke. (2011) Discourse as a "linguistic object": methodical and methodological limitations. *Critical Discourse Studies*, 8(2), 75-94.
- Wodak, R. (2008). Introduction: Discourse studies- important concepts and terms. In & M. Ruth Wodak, *Qualitative discourse analysis in the social sciences* (pp. 1-29). London: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Yousuf, M. (1963). Majlis-e-Ahbab. *Chattan*.
- Zuberi, A. (1971, 08 05). Qaumi mafad aur sarmaya daar. *Al-Fateh*, pp. 59-64.